

PROPOSED USE POLICY
Mobile Parking Payment Systems for
Parking Management and Enforcement

Quinn Wallace
Parking & Mobility Division
Department of Transportation
City of Oakland
April 4 May 6, 2021

1. Purpose^[BH1]_[WQ2]

The City of Oakland Department of Transportation (DOT) intends to enter into an agreement with either a single or multiple mobile parking payment providers (Providers), whose services permit individuals to pay for parking sessions through a mobile phone application (app), website, or text message in Oakland. This agreement would allow these Providers to share parking data with DOT. This dataset would include parking date and start and stop times, customer information like a phone number or email address, credit card type such as Visa or Mastercard, payment amounts, transaction fees for the Providers, and “zones” corresponding to parking location. Zones may match meter ID numbers or may be created by staff for each block, and customers must enter the zone number when paying for parking through a Provider.

DOT is pursuing a new multi-vendor mobile parking payment system in order to increase the convenience of this service to parkers, promote the use of this contactless payment method through a City-branded system, and more holistically support the active management of the parking system. A key improvement will be City of Oakland-branded signs in the PROW that will direct parkers to a webpage with all available Providers and promotions. It is anticipated that positive consumer experiences with contactless payments, such as pay-by-phone parking services, will make more individuals interested in using this payment type, even after the pandemic eases.

By allowing multiple vendors to operate in Oakland, visitors will likely not need to download any additional applications (apps) and share their information with another vendor; rather, they are more likely to be able to use an existing app on their phone and conveniently pay for their parking session. This may also minimize the number of Providers with whom users, especially visitors to Oakland, must share their information to access this payment option. Residents will also benefit from having multiple vendor options, as vendors may compete for long-term customers with lower user fees and promotions.

DOT requires parking data from Providers in order to analyze parking revenues and demand and to enforce parking restrictions, such as time limits and meter payments. These uses ultimately inform parking policies and practices that support the City’s Parking Principles (Resolution No. 84664 CMS) and shape a more equitable mobility system.

In providing DOT with parking data, DOT can ensure that parking rates are accurately charged to parkers and that the City receives accurate parking payments, particularly from numbered block zones in demand-responsive parking program areas. In these areas, meter rates change by time of day and block; without seeing the zones in transaction data, DOT would not be able to program these specific areas' rates or confirm the accuracy of Providers' rates or revenues in reconciliations and audits. — Suggest they leverage a provider in CA or one that aligns with CCPA laws^[BH3]

Parking data published to the Provider's online platform will be provided from parker transactions and include parking date and start and stop times, payment amounts, transaction fees for the Providers, and "zones" corresponding to parking location. This data will include no personally identifiable information or license plate information, and DOT staff will use this data for financial and parking analyses. Outside the portal, DOT staff's parking data analyses may summarize this data by zone, date, hour, transaction type, device type, parking duration, or amount.

2. Authorized Use

Only designated DOT and Finance Department staff will have access to data received from Providers. This data will be used solely to analyze parking revenues and demand, enforce parking restrictions, and shape parking policies and practices.

Parking policies and practices are intended to support the City's Parking Principles (Resolution No. 84664 CMS) and shape a more equitable mobility system. Specific applications of mobile parking payment data that supports this effort may include, but are not limited to^[BH4] will include only for the following purposes:

- a) Estimating parking demand, occupancy, and revenues
- b) Evaluating parking payment options
- c) Monitoring demand-responsive parking areas and compliance
- d) Reconciling payment transactions with total parking revenues received
- e) Promoting compliance and enforcing parking restrictions, permits, and payment

3. Data Collection

DOT does not collect mobile parking payment data and does not have access to user account information. Mobile parking payment users generate data by making transactions. This dataset would will include ^[BH5] parking date and start and stop-end times, customer information like a phone number or email address, credit card numbers, payment amounts, transaction fees for the Providers, and numbered "zones" corresponding to parking location. —The Providers then collect this data in order to process the financial transactions. A subset of this Transaction data is will then aggregated be anonymized and shared with DOT for staff's financial and parking analyses. DOT staff will require that no personally identifiable information or license plate

~~information be included in this dataset. Parking data may be summarized by zone, date, hour, transaction type, device type, parking duration, or amount.~~

4. Data Access

Authorized staff may be from the DOT Parking and Mobility Division ~~and~~ the City's Finance Department, ~~and other City departments, divisions, or teams that help manage the parking system.~~ [BH6][WQ7]

Data will be accessed through Providers' online platforms. Authorized users of the online platforms will require a unique username and password. ~~Because all data in the platform will have no personally identifiable information or license plate numbers, a~~Any data shared outside the platform, ~~such as through public records requests or court orders, will have first been anonymized~~be anonymous, removing privacy risk [BH8], ~~and will therefore not require strict access controls. -~~Ensure provider aligns with CCPA law [BH9]

5. Data Protection

DOT will depend on each Provider to securely store, transmit, and audit transaction and user data per industry best practices. ~~Because DOT has not yet procured the Providers, DOT staff does not yet know official data protection protocols that each Provider will use.~~ [BH10][WQ11] DOT will require that every Provider has a secure gateway service for secure (encrypted) credit card data transmission to the City's merchant account Provider. Additionally, Providers' credit card data transmission will be required to provide a current certification through the Payment Card Industry Data Security Standards (PCI DSS). Major Providers such as ParkMobile, Passport, and PayByPhone maintain PCI DSS Level 1 certification. ~~This was the security requirement that the City sought when procuring mobile parking payment services in 2015. -~~Ensure provider aligns with CCPA law. ~~Is this the only foundational security requirement that DOT asks?~~ [BH12]

6. Data Retention

~~Providers may store raw (unaggregated) parking payment transaction data for no more than two (2) years. This amount of time represents the precedent that was required in the 2016 agreement between ParkMobile and the City of Oakland.~~ [BH13][WQ14] If the contract between a Provider and DOT is severed, the Provider will be required to delete all raw parking payment transaction data collected in Oakland. ~~The proposed contract will be three (3) years with the option of up to two (2) one-year extensions. This precedent is the amount of time provided in the current agreement between the City and ParkMobile. -~~Where is the current data from ParkMobile App? ~~How long is the proposed contract? Oakland needs to be able to get that data regardless of the duration or cessation of the contract. Can user info and data from Park Mobile be migrated to the new provider?~~ [BH15]

Staff currently do not have access to any user account information and will continue to not have this access to protect user privacy. Staff will not ask ParkMobile to migrate user information or data to any new Provider(s) operating under the new mobile parking payment system.

7. Public Access

The public may access anonymized data through public records requests, subpoenas, warrants, and other court orders. ~~However, DOT will only release data in a highly aggregated and obfuscated form to the point where privacy risk is removed.~~ [BH16][WQ17]

8. Third-Party Data-Sharing

Data shared by users under this agreement will be generated, ingested, and stored by a third party, the Provider(s), to reduce privacy risk. Under this agreement, DOT will not have any access to user account information and thus, sensitive user information will be protected from public records requests and court orders. This third-party service reduces the risk of surveillance and eliminates the possibility of user identification by City staff. Further, DOT does not have the capacity or means to create a mobile parking payment service in-house specific to Oakland parkers. This data will not be shared with unauthorized staff or non-City entities, unless obtained through public records requests. [BH18]. ~~Communication must be sent out to App users notifying them of these data requests. With a possible option to opt out (CCPA law)~~ [BH19][WQ20] DOT will require that Providers have a user agreement in place that includes a provision about sharing data for legal proceedings and requirements.

9. Training

Each Provider will provide web-based or on-site training for authorized City staff. These staff will be in the DOT Parking & Mobility Division or in the Finance Department. Staff will require every Provider to incorporate this use policy ~~and related privacy policies and procedures~~ [BH21] into their operating procedures.

10. Audit and Oversight

DOT will require each Provider to provide a fully auditable mobile parking payment service, which was also a requirement of the 2016 agreement between the City of Oakland and ParkMobile. DOT ~~or Finance~~ staff will audit [BH22][WQ23] Providers through their respective back-end online data portals, in addition to Providers going through PCI DSS audits. Audits by DOT staff will occur on as-needed basis, such as audits of a sub-set of zones where meter rates were recently changed. General oversight of the Providers will be the responsibility of the Parking & Mobility Division Manager.

Providers' audits may vary depending on the services that they provide. The legally enforceable sanctions for violations of the policy include relevant administrative instructions as well as provisions in the Surveillance and Community Safety Ordinance.

11. Maintenance

Providers will maintain and manage all data generated through their respective app, website, and text message services. Providers may also depend on other companies for certain functions, such as for cloud data storage services; staff will ask that selected Providers disclose all additional companies in the procurement process. ~~—Need to know providers storage management policies, and ensure all CCPA laws are being followed.~~ [BH24]

Questions or comments concerning this draft Use Policy should be directed to Michael Ford, Division Manager, Parking and Mobility Division, via email at mford@oaklandca.gov or phone at (510) 238-7670.